

## Lecture 10 Reading Questions

### “Against Redistribution”

#### Readings:

Selections from “Anarchy, State, and Utopia” by Robert Nozick.

(1) What is the distinction between *historical* principles and *end-result* principles? What is the distinction between *patterned* and *non-patterned* historical principles? What kind of principle is the principle of utility? What kinds of principles are at work in the following statements:

- (i) “The distribution of property is unjust unless everyone has enough to meet his or her basic needs.”
- (ii) “The distribution of income is unjust unless everyone had a decent opportunity to compete for the better-paying jobs.”

(2) What does Nozick mean when he says that “liberty upsets patterns”? What does he mean by “liberty,” “upsets,” and “patterns”?

(3) “Patterned principles of justice necessitate redistributive activities.” Why?

(4) According to Nozick, “taxation of earnings from labor is on a par with forced labor.” Why?

(5) Patterned principles of justice give others “a property right in you,” says Nozick. Is that true? In what sense?

(6) “[H]oldings to which people are entitled may not be seized, even to provide equality of opportunity for others.” How does Nozick respond to the charge that the results of market exchanges (“transfers” of “holdings”) are unfair unless everyone has an equal opportunity to compete? Do you find his response persuasive? Why or why not?

MIT OpenCourseWare  
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

24.04J / 17.01J Justice  
Spring 2012

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.