

- Roles of stereotypes in ethnography
- Could have had more ethnographic material
- *What happens when countries are in distress? How to address trauma across cultural boundaries in times of upheaval?*
- *How can we address structural effects on a person's consciousness? How to assess the state of an individual in disordered societies?*

Discussion of Reading

- Manga (case in reading) – unwed mother, causing problems in family. Shot by family during apartheid. Did psychological analysis postmortem, family did not receive aid because she was considered unstable.
- Consider how to think about mental health in wider scope
- In diagnostic actions, people relive traumatic events
- Clinicians were faced with a challenge in determining what is relevant in biomedical framework.
- With diagnosis of PTSD, patients are relieved of responsibility for actions
 - Only thing considered outside person is cause
 - Everything else is located inside
 - How external events affect person internally
 - PTSD is still controversial, and not all agree to its designation
- Biomedicine was deeply involved in supporting apartheid policies
- In this context, what relevance does psychiatry have?
- *In situations of war and violence, should health professionals stay neutral?*
 - In facing people with disorders, hard to stay neutral
 - What happens if clinicians are guided by stereotypes?
 - If so, then are clinicians replicating and reproducing stereotypes?
 - How conscious are clinicians of the extent to which they are influenced by stereotypes? How aware are they of what is going on in their heads?
- In Haiti: clinicians secretly helped poor supporters of democracy during the 1991-1994 coup period, although they could have been attacked
- Traumatic events were seen to cause disorders
- After end of conflict, nation needed healing from biomedical as well as indigenous healing practices
 - Sometimes are in conflict, but sometimes necessary to resolve conflicts and effects

Chapter 2:

- Deals with issue of medical pluralism
- John (case study): psychotic, biomedicine did not work to treat, mother believed the spirits were angry that he did not become a healer. Believed he was possessed.
- How to accommodate different medical viewpoints in biomedical science?

- None of the health officials used mom's knowledge about situation. Why wasn't the mother's expertise about the situation used in determining the problem and treatment?
- Cross-cultural look at schizophrenia:
 - 2 different studies
 - Developing countries have more cases than developed (why?)
 - Unsure whether it is from bias in definitions of schizophrenia, or actually that there are more cases
 - Quicker onset in developing countries
 - Outcomes are better in developing countries
 - In developing world, people can be mentally ill and still be productive and fulfill social role, which can control course of illness.
 - Role of economy in mental illness
 - Easier to get back into society in the long-term in developing world
- Schwartz wants more ethnographic experience, more lived experience rooted in certain ideologies
 - Lived experience can give more knowledge about patterns of social suffering
 - Lack of knowledge about the 'Other' in clinical settings can reinforce notions of status quo unconsciously, reinforce common notions of 'normal' and 'Other'

Chapter 10

- Transient psychoses. Psychosis and possession states often similar. How to determine difference, treat?
- Biological and psychosocial interlinked, can't separate.
- There are other influences that make possession/psychosis difficult to study. For example, difficult in situations where alcohol or drugs are used
- Transient disorders, dissociation, on larger scale are linked to 'primitive' societies
- 'Modern' world also causes fragmentation of mind
 - Multiple personalities increasingly common
 - Becoming a first-world disease
 - This is becoming a convergence point between 1st and 3rd world
 - *To what extent do clinicians want to pathologize these experiences? Should it these be considered on a continuum between socially acceptable and pathological, rather than strict discrete units of separation?*
- Explores how certain behaviors are seen as pathological
- African/African-American men in developed settings are diagnosed with schizophrenia in much greater numbers than in any other racial group
- There are more complex ways to engage these issues that are not rooted in Western context
- Questions notion of the autonomous individual. *Is this a valid model?*
- Flexible self and boundaries between individual and environment/social world are malleable

- Schwartz can point out similarities to Western model, but still recalls questions of power, since Western world still defines notions of person, normal, and pathological
- Western world still holds power to construct knowledge about other
- Malleability of person – described in O.Butler book (to be read next week)

Movie: *The Return of Sara Baartman*

- Georges Cuvier: French scientist who dissected Saartje Baartman (Hottentot Venus).
 - Baartman's callipygean character likened to monkeys.
 - Physiognomy repeatedly likened to orangutans.
- Baartman elevated French and medicine: she became part of French medical heritage
- She was a symbol of black women's sexuality.
- Represented missing link to many people. She was used to establish link between animal kingdom and human.
- Her skeleton remained on public display until 1967.
- Brain size same as Descartes, establishing that brain size cannot be used as a marker for intelligence, etc.
- Ironically, she was born in 1789, the same year that supposedly marked the end of sexism, racism, and restored respect for women in France
- After years of negotiation, French government gave up her remains.
- Her remains were taken to South Africa, buried on South Africa's day of women
- Issues brought up in transferring her, determining her burial site and historical memorial:
 - Who has the right to speak for her? Tribe? Country?
 - Why can decide for her?
 - Issue in using her tissue for experiments a considered a matter of informed consent
 - Giving respect: one aspect of paying respects to her can be seen as a political act – her suffering is focal point and outlet for collective social suffering.

MIT OpenCourseWare
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

21A.460J / WGS.620J Medicine, Religion and Politics in Africa and the African Diaspora
Spring 2005

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.